



November 1, 2001

Ms. Julie Reagan Watson
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Human Services
P.O. Box 149030
Austin, Texas 78714-9030

OR2001-5021

Dear Ms. Watson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 154204.

The Texas Department of Human Services (the "department") received a request for "a copy of the most recent HCFA on site survey and complaint history" for Access Quality Therapy Services. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We must first address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(e)(1), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A)-(D). You acknowledge that you failed to submit written comments stating the reasons why each exception that you raised would allow the information to be withheld within the fifteen-business-day deadline. We also note that you failed to submit the specific information requested within the fifteen-business-day deadline.

¹ As the department failed to provide arguments in support of its initial claim under section 552.130, we assume that the department is no longer asserting that exceptions.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301(e) results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.--Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Normally, a compelling interest is that some other source of law makes the information confidential or that third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). As section 552.101 of the Government Code provides a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address your arguments under that exception. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977) (presumption of openness overcome by a showing that the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests).

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. You assert that some of the documents at issue are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 142.009(d) of the Health and Safety Code. Section 142.009(d) provides as follows:

The reports, records, and working papers used or developed in an investigation made under [Chapter 142] are confidential and may not be released or made public except:

- (1) to a state or federal agency;
- (2) to federal, state, or local law enforcement personnel;
- (3) with the consent of each person identified in the information released;
- (4) in civil or criminal litigation matters or licensing proceedings as otherwise allowed by law or judicial rule;
- (5) on a form developed by the department that identifies any deficiencies found without identifying a person, other than the home and community support services agency;
- (6) on a form required by a federal agency if:
 - (A) the information does not reveal the identity of an individual, including a patient or a physician or other medical practitioner;

(B) the service provider subject to the investigation had a reasonable opportunity to review the information and offer comments to be included with the information released or made public; and

(C) the release of the information complies with any other federal requirement; or

(7) as provided by Section 142.0092.

You argue that the documents in Attachment C constitute reports, records, and working papers that were used or developed during a complaint investigation made under section 142.009(c) of the Health and Safety Code. Furthermore, you have provided no information that would allow us to conclude that any of the exceptions to confidentiality in section 142.009(d) apply in this instance. Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we conclude that the department must withhold Attachment C from the requestor pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 142.009(d) of the Health and Safety Code.

Next, you contend that a portion of the state form submitted as Attachment D is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 142.009(d)(5) of the Health and Safety Code. As noted above, section 142.009(d) states that "reports, records, and working papers used or developed in an investigation . . . are confidential and may not be released or made public except: (5) on a form developed by the department that identifies any deficiencies found without identifying a person, other than the home and community support services agency." Health & Safety Code § 142.009(d)(5). You acknowledge that section 142.009(d)(5) requires the department to release the state form; however, you contend the department must withhold the name of the individual contained within the form under section 142.009(d)(5). Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we conclude that the department must withhold the name of the individual highlighted in the state form in Attachment D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 142.009(d)(5) of the Health and Safety Code.

To summarize, we conclude that (1) the department must withhold Attachment C from the requestor pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 142.009(d) of the Health and Safety Code; and (2) the department must withhold the name of the individual highlighted in the state form in Attachment D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 142.009(d)(5) of the Health and Safety Code. The remaining information in Attachment D must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dept. of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the General Services Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Karen A. Eckerle
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KAE/sdk

Ref: ID# 154204

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Cindy L. Pearce
Quality Analyst
Aetna U.S. Healthcare
4400 Northwest Loop 410, Suite 500
San Antonio, Texas 78229
(w/o enclosures)